

Abdul Haseeb Ansari

# Comparative Jurisprudence

A Comparative Appraisal of  
Western Jurisprudence and  
Islamic Jurisprudence

Foreword by Dr. Justice B.S. Chauhan

**Serials**

# COMPARATIVE JURISPRUDENCE

A Comparative Appraisal of Western Jurisprudence  
and Islamic Jurisprudence

ABDUL HASEEB ANSARI



SERIALS PUBLICATIONS PVT. LTD.  
New Delhi (India)

© Abdul Haseeb Ansari

First Published in 2018

ISBN: 978-93-86611-31-4

*All rights reserved with the Publisher, including the right to translate or reproduce this book or parts thereof except for brief quotations in critical articles or reviews.*

*Published in India by*



**SERIALS PUBLICATIONS PVT. LTD.**

4830/24, Ansari Road, Darya Ganj, New Delhi-110002, (India)

Ph.: 011-2324 5225, 2325 9207

Email: [serials@mail.com](mailto:serials@mail.com); Website: [www.serialspublications.com](http://www.serialspublications.com)

Printed by: G.S. Offset

## Contents

<i>Preface</i>	xvii
<i>Foreword</i>	xix
<i>List of Cases</i>	xxi
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xxvii

### 1. Introduction..... 1-8

### 2. Meaning, Scope and Relevance of Jurisprudence:..... 9-70 A Comparative Exposition

2.1 Nature, Scope and Relevance of Jurisprudence	9
2.1.1 Nature of Jurisprudence	9
2.1.2 Scope of Jurisprudence	17
2.1.3 Jurisprudence as Science and as Philosophy	21
2.1.4 Relevance of Jurisprudence	22
2.2 Inconsistency in Legal Theories	28
2.3 Nature, Scope and Relevance of Islamic Jurisprudence	34
2.3.1 Nature	34
2.3.2 Scope	40
2.3.3 Relevance	41
2.4 Unanimity and Divergence in the Four Sunni <i>Madhab</i> (Schools of Law)	43
2.4.1 The Hanafi School	43
2.4.2 The Maliki School	45
2.4.3 The Shafi'i School	46

or reproduce this book or

LTD.

10002, (India)

lications.com

2.4.4	The Hanbali School	47
2.4.5	A Comparative Assessment of the Four Schools of Thought	48
2.4.6	Comparison with the Western Schools	49
2.4.7	Orientalists' Criticisms of Islamic Law and Reply to Them	50
2.4.7.1	Islamic Law Talks About Both Rights and Duties	51
2.4.7.2	There is Plenty of Scope to Develop Law on the Basis of Human Reason	52
2.4.7.3	The Issue of Women's Testimony	55
2.4.7.4	Islamic Laws Do Not Suffer from Antiquity	58
2.4.7.5	Islamic Law is Not Barbaric	59
2.4.7.6	It is Possible to Codify Islamic Law	62
2.4.7.7	There is no Discrimination Against Non-Muslim Minorities	62
2.4.7.8	Islam is a Religion of Peace and Amity	64
2.4.7.9	Islam Does Not Provide Husbands Right to Divorce Arbitrarily	64
2.5	Comparison: Conclusion	65
	<i>References</i>	68
3.	<b>Natural Law Theories and their Affinity with Islamic Jurisprudence</b>	<b>71-116</b>
3.1	Introduction	71
3.2	Development of Natural Law Theory Through Ages	74
3.2.1	Greek Theories	74
3.2.2	Roman Theories	76
3.2.3	Theories of the Middle Ages	78
3.2.4	Theories in Sixteenth to Eighteenth Centuries	84
3.2.4.1	Thomas Hobbes	85
3.2.4.2	John Locke	88
3.2.4.3	Rousseau	90
3.3	Revival of Natural Law	92
3.3.1	HLA Hart: Minimum Content of Natural Law	93

<i>Comparative Jurisprudence</i>	<i>Contents</i>	<i>vii</i>
	3.3.2 Fuller	94
Schools	3.3.2.1 Grudge Informer Case	97
	3.3.3 Finnis	98
	3.4 Islamic Perspective	102
and Reply	3.4.1 The <i>Shari'ah</i>	103
	3.4.2 <i>Fiqh</i>	107
1 Rights	3.4.3 Permanence and Change in Islamic Law	108
	3.5 A Comparative Assessment	110
develop	3.5.1 General	110
reason	3.5.2 Classical Natural Law	110
mony	3.5.3 Saint Aquinas and the Islamic Approach of Law	111
rom Antiquity	3.5.4 Social Contract Theories	114
	3.5.5 Revival of Natural Law	114
c Law	3.6 Conclusion	115
gainst	<i>References</i>	115
and Amity	4. Command Theory of Legal Positivism and <i>Hukum Shar'i</i> : .....117-149	
bands	A Comparative Assessment	
	4.1 Introduction	117
	4.2 Command Theory	119
	4.3 Early Development of Command Theory	120
	4.4 Bentham's Positivism/Utilitarianism	121
nic.....71-116	4.5 Austin's Theory	123
	4.5.1 Criticism by Salmond	126
	4.5.2 Criticism by HLA Hart	127
Ages	4.6 Bentham and Austin Compared	128
	4.7 The <i>Shari'ah</i> Concept of <i>Hukum</i> ( <i>Hukum Shar'i</i> )	131
	4.7.1 Classification of <i>Hukum</i>	132
	4.7.2 Defining Rule ( <i>Al-Hukm Al-Taklifi</i> )	132
enturies	4.7.3 Obligation ( <i>Al-Ijab</i> )	134
	4.7.4 Recommendation ( <i>Al-Nadb</i> )	135
	4.7.5 Prohibition ( <i>Al-Tahrim</i> )	135
	4.7.6 Reprehension ( <i>Al-Karabah</i> )	135
	4.7.7 Permission ( <i>Al-Ibahah</i> )	136
iral Law		

4.7.8	Declaratory Rule ( <i>Al-Kukm Al-Wad'i</i> )	136
4.7.9	Cause ( <i>Al-Sabab</i> )	136
4.7.10	Condition ( <i>Al-Shart</i> )	137
4.7.11	Impediment ( <i>Al-Man'i</i> )	138
4.8	The Lawgiver ( <i>Al-Hakim</i> )	138
4.9	The Subject Matter of <i>Hukm</i> ( <i>Al-Mahkum Fil</i> )	140
4.10	The Legally Competent Person ( <i>Al-Mahkum 'Alayh</i> )	143
4.11	Comparative Assessment	144
4.12	Conclusion	147
	<i>References</i>	148
5.	<b>Law and Morality: A Comparative Appraisal.....</b>	<b>150-190</b>
5.1	Introduction	150
5.2	Relationships	151
5.2.1	'Morality as the Basis of Law	151
5.2.2	Morality as the Test of Law	153
5.2.3	Morality as the End of Law	155
5.3	Law and Morality: Fuller	156
5.4	Law and Morality: Homosexuality and Same-Sex Marriage	160
5.4.1	Homosexuality	161
5.4.2	Artificial Insemination and use of Frozen Eggs	165
5.5	Legislatures and Morality	166
5.6	Judicial Solicitude: National Level	168
5.7	Other Contemporary Moral Issues	177
5.8	Islamic morality	180
5.8.1	General	180
5.8.2	Categories of Men	182
5.8.3	Basis of Morality: Intention	183
5.8.4	Wrong Committed to Allah and Wrong to Man	184
5.8.5	Public Morality and Private Morality	184
5.8.6	Guardian of Morality	185
5.8.7	A Wider Concept	185
5.9	The Qur'an	186

136	5.10 The <i>Sunnah</i>	187
136	5.11 Comparison	188
137	5.12 Conclusion	189
138	References	189
138		
140	6. Law and Justice: A Comparative Evaluation .....	191-228
143	6.1 Introduction	191
144	6.2 Various Conceptions of Justice	192
147	6.2.1 David Hume	192
148	6.2.2 Aristotle	193
..... 150-190	6.2.3 Procedural Justice and Substantive Justice	195
150	6.2.4 Jeremy Bentham	195
151	6.2.5 Social Contract Theorists	196
151	6.2.6 Karl Marx	196
153	6.2.7 Salmond	197
155	6.2.8 Dias: Five Tasks Justice	198
156	6.2.9 John Rawls: 'Justice as Fairness'	200
160	6.2.9.1 Original Position	201
	6.2.9.2 Principles of Justice	201
	6.2.9.3 Criticism	202
	6.2.9.4 Overlapping Consensus	204
161	6.2.10 Robert Nozick	207
165	6.2.10.1 Criticism	208
166	6.3 Public Interest Litigations and Procedural Justice	210
168	6.4 Justice Delayed Is Justice Denied	212
177	6.5 Islamic Perspective Of Justice	213
180	6.5.1 General	213
180	6.5.2 Social Justice	217
182	6.5.3 Economic Justice	219
183	6.5.4 Legal and Procedural Justice	220
184	6.5.5 Cardinal Points	221
184	6.6 Comparison	225
185	6.7 Conclusion	227
185	References	227
186		



7. Rights and Duties in Civil Law and the <i>Shari'ah</i> : .....	229-251
A Comparative Appraisal	
7.1 Introduction	229
7.2 Position in Western Jurisprudence	231
7.2.1 Nature of Rights	231
7.2.1.1 Austin	232
7.2.1.2 Jhering	232
7.2.1.3 Salmond	232
7.2.1.4 Gray	233
7.2.1.5 Holland	233
7.2.2 Characteristics of a Right	234
7.2.3 Theories of Rights	235
7.2.4 Hohfeld's Jural Relations	235
7.2.5 Rights and Duties: Relationship	236
7.2.6 Kinds of Legal Rights	238
7.3 Position in Islamic Jurisprudence	241
7.3.1 Right ( <i>Haqq</i> )	241
7.3.1.1 General	241
7.3.1.2 The Literal Meaning of Right	242
7.3.1.3 The Legal Meaning of Right	243
7.3.1.4 The Juridical Definition of a Right	243
7.3.2 Contemporary Approach	244
7.3.3 Duty	249
7.4 Conclusion	250
References	251
8. Custom as a Source of Law in the Contemporary World:.....	252-267
A Comparative Exposition	
8.1 Introduction	252
8.2 Position of Custom in Western Jurisprudence	253
8.2.1 General	253
8.2.2 Conventional Customs	254
8.2.3 Local Custom	255
8.2.4 Custom as Law	257
8.2.5 Custom and Prescription	258

..... 229-251

229

231

231

232

232

232

233

233

234

235

235

236

238

241

241

241

242

243

Right

243

244

249

250

251

World:.....252-267

252

253

253

254

255

257

258

8.3	Position of Custom in Islamic Law	258
8.3.1	Conceptual Aspects and Importance	258
8.3.2	Justification ( <i>Hujjiyyah</i> )	261
8.3.3	Comparison with Tradition ( <i>Adah, Plural, Adat</i> ) and Consensus ( <i>Ijma</i> )	262
8.3.4	Requirement of 'Urf	262
8.4	Comparison	264
8.5	Conclusion	265
	References	266

## 9. Judicial Precedents: An Expository Study of Civil Judicial ..... 268-297 System and *Shari'ah* Court System

9.1	Introduction	268
9.2	Judicial Precedents in Civil Law	269
9.3	Judicial Precedents: Advantages and Disadvantages	272
9.4	Circumstances that Destroy or Weaken the Binding Force of Precedents	275
9.5	Circumstances that Increase or Decrease the Authority of Precedents	279
9.6	Stare Decisis in Some Countries	279
9.6.1	Malaysian Position	279
9.6.2	Indian Position	280
9.7	Ratio Decidendi	281
9.7.1	Meaning	281
9.7.2	Methods to Determine <i>Ratio</i>	282
9.8	Do Judges Make Law?	283
9.8.1	Declaratory Theory	284
9.8.2	Judges do Make Law	285
9.9	Judicial Precedents in the <i>Shari'ah</i> and State Practices	287
9.9.1	<i>Shari'ah</i> Position	287
9.9.1.1	Qadhi	287
9.9.1.2	Hierarchy of Courts	288
9.9.1.3	Doctrine of Judicial Precedent	289
9.9.2	State Practice	290
9.9.2.1	Malaysian Position	290

9.9.2.2	Position in Pakistan	293
9.9.2.3	Position in Saudi Arabia	294
9.10.	Conclusion	295
	<i>References</i>	296
<b>10.</b>	<b>Possession and Ownership: A Comparative Appraisal.....</b>	<b>298-329</b>
10.1	Introduction	298
10.2	Possession	298
10.2.1	The Concept of Possession	298
10.2.2	Reasons for Protecting Possession	300
10.2.3	Savigny's Theory of Possession	302
10.2.4	Possession in Fact	302
10.2.5	Possession in Law	303
10.2.6	Possessory Remedies	307
10.3	Ownership'	309
10.3.1	Absolute Ownership	310
10.3.2	Meaning and Scope of Ownership	310
10.3.3	Acquisition of Ownership	314
10.3.4	Sole Ownership and Co-ownership	314
10.3.5	Trust and Beneficial Ownership	315
10.3.6	Vested Ownership and Contingent Ownership	316
10.3.7	Legal and Equitable Ownership	317
10.4	Islamic Perspective of Possession and Ownership	319
10.4.1	Property	319
10.4.2	Ownership	320
10.4.2.1	Types of Ownership	320
10.4.2.2	Modes of Acquiring Ownership	322
10.4.2.3	Acquiring Ownership in Res Nullius/ Terra Nullius	322
10.4.2.4	"Finders Keepers"	323
10.4.2.5	Religious Limitations on Ownership	324
10.5	Possession	326
10.6	Comparative Assessment	327
10.7	Conclusion	328
	<i>References</i>	328

	293
	294
	295
	296
al.....	298-329
	298
	298
	298
	300
	302
	302
	303
	307
	309
	310
	310
	314
	314
	315
nership	316
	317
ip	319
	319
	320
	320
hip	322
Nullius/	322
	323
nership	324
	326
	327
	328
	328

11. A Comparative Exposition of Feminist Jurisprudence.....	330-404
11.1 Introduction	330
11.2 Historical Perspective of the Development of Feminist- Jurisprudence in the West	334
11.3 Various Strands of the Feminist Movement	341
11.4 Common Issues	341
11.4.1 Oppression	341
11.4.2 Patriarchy	342
11.4.3 Exploitation of Women	345
11.4.4 Equality or Equity	346
11.4.5 The Issue of Justice	352
11.5 Feminist Methodology	354
11.6 Contemporary Issues	355
11.6.1 General	355
11.6.2 Sexual Harassment at the Place of Work	356
11.6.3 Issues Pertaining to LGBT	359
11.6.4 Pornography	360
11.6.5 Rape	361
11.6.6 Domestic Violence	363
11.6.7 So-Called 'Honour Killings'	365
11.6.8 Neutrality in Decision-Making	365
11.6.9 Abortion	366
11.6.10 Dowry: Paid by Wife to Husband	367
11.6.11 Child Marriage	368
11.6.12 Prostitution	370
11.7 Status of Women in Islam	373
11.7.1 General	373
11.8 Social and Educational Affairs	375
11.8.1 Right to Property	377
11.8.2 Right to Work	378
11.8.3 Hospitality	379
11.8.4 Child Marriage	379
11.8.5 Newborn Abandoned Children	380
11.9 Political Affairs	382
11.10 Marriage/Dower	383

11.11 Contemporary Issues	385
11.11.1 Reproductive Rights	385
11.11.2 Conjugal Rights	390
11.11.3 Rights of Hermaphrodites ( <i>Khunthas</i> )	391
11.11.4 Family Violence	391
11.11.5 Women as Judges	393
11.11.6 Registration of Muslim Marriage	395
11.11.7 Family Law Reforms	396
11.12 International Law	397
11.13 Comparison: Conclusion	398
References	402
<b>12. Jurisprudence in Third World Countries: .....405-473</b>	
A Critical Exposition with Special Reference to Muslim Countries	
12.1 Introduction	405
12.2 Nature and Scope of Jurisprudence in Third World Countries	407
12.3 Relevance of Various Traditional Legal Theories	411
12.3.1 Natural Law Theories	411
12.3.2 Positive Law Theories	412
12.3.3 Historical and Anthropological Theories	414
12.3.4 Economic Theory	415
12.3.5 Sociological Approach	416
12.3.6 Realism	417
12.4 Constitution and its Amendment	419
12.5 Form of Government: Demand for Democracy	423
12.6 Judicial Independence	427
12.7 Distributive Justice	433
12.8 Land Reforms	438
12.9 Law and Social Control	447
12.9.1 Informal and Formal Social Control	447
12.9.2 Death Penalty	453
12.9.3 Crimes without Victims	455
12.9.4 Commercial Crimes	460
12.9.5 Premarital Sex	463

385  
385  
390  
391  
391  
393  
395  
396  
397  
398  
402  
..... 405-473  
  
405  
rld Countries 407  
411  
411  
412  
s 414  
415  
416  
417  
419  
423  
427  
433  
438  
447  
447  
453  
455  
460  
463

12.10 Law and Social Change	465
12.10.1 Theoretical Aspect	465
12.10.2 Relationship between Social Changes and Legal Changes	467
12.11 Conclusion	470
References	472
<b>13. Contemporary Jurisprudential Issues in Terrorism and ..... 474-535</b> <b>their Islamic Perspectives: A Comparative Assessment</b>	
13.1 Introduction	474
13.2 To Have a Viable Definition	479
13.2.1 General or Specific Definitions	482
13.2.2 Judicial Solicitude	483
13.2.3 Objects	485
13.2.4 Individual Terrorist	486
13.2.5 Means	487
13.2.6 State Terrorism	488
13.2.7 Pre-Emptive Strikes Are Encouraging Terrorism	492
13.2.8 Self-Determination and Terrorism	496
13.2.9 International Terrorism	497
13.3 Terrorism and Islam	499
13.3.1 Islam is Against Terrorism	499
13.3.2 <i>Madrasas</i> are for Religious Teachings	502
13.3.3 Terrorists are Not Martyrs	503
13.4 Prisoners of War	503
13.4.1 Taking Prisoners of War	503
13.4.2 Illegal Detentions (POWs)	505
13.4.3 Torture to Prisoners	511
13.4.4 Denial of Procedural Justice	516
13.5 Conclusion	524
References	529
<b>Bibliography .....</b>	<b>536-569</b>
<b>Index .....</b>	<b>570-575</b>



**Serials Publications Pvt. Ltd.**

4830/24, Ansari Road, Darya Ganj

New Delhi-110002, (India)

Ph.: 23245225, 23259207

e-mail: [serials@mail.com](mailto:serials@mail.com)

visit us: [www.serialspublications.com](http://www.serialspublications.com)

Price ₹3000/-

ISBN 978-93-86611-31-4



9 789386 611314